

Positive Peace and Gender Equity

University of Massachusetts Lowell
Fall 2015

Coral Group Research Team

Professor Paula Rayman
Andrea Andzenge
Jennifer Castano
Gabrielle Davis
Maria Deiana
Donna Hackley
Limheang Heng
Seth Izen
Michele Ross

© 2015 – Content of report may not be republished without the written consent of the authors.
To obtain permission to reproduce, contact

Paula Rayman, PhD, University of Massachusetts Lowell at Paula_Rayman@uml.edu

ABSTRACT

Research into “peace” has often neglected the experience and role of women. While the newly launched Positive Peace Index endeavors to rank countries according to the level of positive peace measured by a set of 24 indicators within 8 pillars, it utilizes only one gender specific indicator. In order to shine a light on the importance of focusing on women in studying peace, the Coral Group of University of Massachusetts Lowell applied a gendered lens to all eight pillars by selecting appropriate gendered indicators. The methodology also incorporated five national case studies - Bosnia-Herzegovina, Cambodia, Columbia, Nigeria and Rwanda - to give a closer examination of the intersection between gender equity and building sustainable peace societies. The report is a clarion call to researchers that if “we measure what we value” then we must begin to value the role of women in peacebuilding.

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Paula Rayman, Founding Director of the Peace and Conflict Studies Program, Director of the Middle East Center for Peace, Development and Culture, Gender Consultant for United States Institute of Peace

Andrea Andzenge, MA in Peace and Conflict Studies, Global Studies Doctorate Program, University of Massachusetts Lowell

Jennifer Castano, MA in Peace and Conflict Studies, University of Massachusetts Lowell

Gabrielle Davis, BA in Peace and Conflict Studies, University of Massachusetts Lowell

Maria Deiana Ph.D, Research Fellow School of Politics, International Studies and Philosophy. Queen's University Belfast

Donna Hackley, MA in Peace and Conflict Studies, University of Massachusetts Lowell

Limheang Heng, MA in Peace and Conflict Studies, University of Massachusetts Lowell

Seth Izen, Assistant Director, Middle East Center for Peace, Development and Culture, MA in Peace and Conflict Studies, University of Massachusetts Lowell

Michele Ross, Peace and Conflict Studies Master of Arts Program, University of Massachusetts Lowell

ADVISORY BOARD

Lourdes Beneria, Professor Emerita at Cornell University's Department of City & Regional Planning, Cornell University

Linda Bishai, Director, North Africa at the Center for Middle East and Africa, United States Institute of Peace

Cynthia Enloe, Research Professor in the Department of International Development, Community, and Environment at Clark University

Yvonne Galligan, Director, University's Gender Initiative; Director, Centre for the Advancement of Women in Politics, Queen's University Belfast

Nira Yuval-Davis, Director of the Centre for Research on Migration, Refugees and Belonging University of East London

INTRODUCTION

In the recent past there has been increased attention to the relationship of gender equity and peace building. In general there is recognition that while women have often suffered greatly from intra-state and interstate violence, this has largely remained invisible and women themselves have been mostly absent from peace negotiations and as leaders in political, economic and social national institutions. While there is growing work on women in peace research, there is still much left undone.

In response, the Coral Group of the University of Massachusetts Lowell launched a study, utilizing evidenced based research and a case-study methodology to explore how gender intersects with categories of building positive peace.

The group understands that the concept of peace encompasses more than the absence of war and that violence includes more than visible physical abuse. In 1969 political theorist Johan Galtung differentiated *direct violence* such as physical harm from *structural violence*, “avoidable insults to basic human needs and more generally to life, lowering the real level of needs below what is potentially possible.” While direct violence includes killing and maiming and rape, structural violence includes exploitation, segmentation, marginalization and even exclusion. In other words when there is systemic inequality in the distribution of freedom, justice and economic, social and political resources in a society then structural violence is taking place.

To translate this comprehension into a new formulation, the Institute for Economics and Peace developed the first Positive Peace Index (PPI) in 2012. The Index defines peace as "the set of attitudes, institutions, and structures which, when strengthened, lead to a more peaceful society". PPI utilizes over 300 country data sets and has formulated 8 pillars, each with three indicators, that are inter connected to promote a path towards sustainable peace:

1. Well-Functioning Government
2. Sound Business Environment
3. Equitable Distribution of Resources
4. Acceptance of the Rights of Others

5. Good Relations with Neighbors
6. Free Flow of Information
7. High Levels of Education
8. Low Levels of Corruption

As described by the Institute of Economics and Peace, the ability to measure factors that drive positive peace makes possible the identification of resources and the evaluation of policies and programs that are intended to build and support positive peace within a society. Identifying and measuring these drivers within the positive peace framework allows for concrete development goals to be defined and for specific development outcomes to be measured in order to assess real life, real time, positive impact. Not only do high levels of positive peace correlate with less frequent and less lengthy overt violence in a society, they also correlate with better business competitiveness, improved gender equality, progress on the MDGs, stronger social cohesion and higher levels of happiness. Therefore the ability to measure the level of positive peace and systematically evaluate and adjust its drivers is of utmost importance to those who pursue peacefulness.

Nearly all of the PPI indicators are non-gendered and are a measure of a particular driver of peace within the population. Although not reported in the PPI, some indicators do contain data values that differ for males and females, such as life expectancy and percent enrolled in secondary school. Other PPI indicators may not currently measure or report gendered data formally. However, these indicators may, on further processing of the data, ultimately reveal gendered differences. Intuitively, some indicators with the potential to depict differing values based on gender might include “rule of law” where marital and inheritance rights may differ between men and women, “ease of doing business” where securing loans or holding bank accounts might be more difficult for women, “mobile phone subscriptions” and “youth development index” where access to technology, upper education and civic participation may or may not be equal.

Of the 24 total PPI indicators, only one is specifically gendered. That is, within the Pillar of “Acceptance of the Rights of Others,” the third indicator is a “measure of women’s disadvantage in three dimensions—reproductive health, empowerment and the labour market” which is taken from the Gender Inequality Index, source UNDP. This is the only specifically gendered indicator out of the 24 indicators featured in the PPI.

The Coral Group’s mission was to search for indicators that could reflect gendered data on positive peace and gender justice in a given society using the framework of the 8 pillars described in the Positive Peace Index by the Institute for Economics and Peace. The group believes that in order to ensure that all persons experience the benefits of positive peace, a gendered approach to measuring peacefulness must be employed so that development outcomes are accurately measured. To that end, the group identified various indicators where data begin to reflect life experiences within a society in a gendered fashion.

Of course, there is not a uniform “male” or “female” experience within any given society. Economic standing, social class, religious affiliation, race, education level, urban or rural residence, and other descriptors can all impact the life experience within any particular society. Naturally, all women or all men within a particular society do not necessarily experience “peacefulness” the same way. Nonetheless, in order to initiate development of a systematic approach that takes into account gender justice in positive peacebuilding across all 8 pillars of the PPI, the group pushed forward with its research. The Coral Group proposed to find ways to describe broadly the gendered experience of peacefulness within a society by selecting indicators within each of the 8 pillars of the Positive Peace Index that seemed to reflect how the men and the women of a particular society experience peacefulness.

METHODOLOGY

Indicators for each pillar were selected that reflect gendered experiences. These indicators were applied to five countries — Bosnia-Herzegovina, Cambodia, Columbia, Nigeria and Rwanda – in order to look at the levels of “positive peace” in those countries through a gendered lens.

The following tables illustrate the indicators and data sources used for each pillar:

Pillar 1: Well-Functioning Government

Indicator	Data Source
Lower House: Total Seats (last election)	http://www.ipu.org/wmn-e/classif.htm
No. of Women (%)	
Upper House: Total Seats (last election)	
No. of Women (%)	
Gender Quotas (%)	http://www.quotaproject.org/
Women’s Suffrage	http://www.ipu.org/wmn-e/suffrage.htm

Pillar 2: Sound Business Environment

Indicator	Data Source
Law Mandating Paid/Unpaid Maternity Leave	http://wbl.worldbank.org/data/exploretopics/getting-a-job
Law Mandating Paid/Unpaid Paternity Leave	
Retirement Age with Full Benefits (Female)	http://wbl.worldbank.org/data/exploretopics/getting-a-job#retirement-and-pensions
Retirement Age with Full Benefits (Male)	
Does the law mandate equal remuneration for men and women for equal value?	http://wbl.worldbank.org/data/exploretopics/getting-a-job#workplace-protections
Can Non Pregnant and Non Nursing Women do the Same Jobs As Men?	http://wbl.worldbank.org/data/exploretopics/getting-a-job#working-hours-and-industry-restrictions
Are There Laws Mandating Non Discrimination Based on Gender in Hiring?	

Is There Public Provision of Childcare for Children under the Age of Primary Education?	http://wbl.worldbank.org/data/exploretopics/providing-incentives-to-work
Are There Specific Tax Deductions or Credits Applicable to Only Women?	http://wbl.worldbank.org/data/exploretopics/providing-incentives-to-work#personal-income-tax
Are There Specific Tax Deductions or Credits Applicable to Only Men?	
Percentage of Women in the Workforce (%)	http://wbl.worldbank.org/ (Explore Data-> Economy-> Select your country)

Pillar 3: Equitable Distribution of Resources

Indicator	Data Source
Life expectancy at birth (years) (2012)	https://spreadsheets.google.com/pub?key=phAwcNAVuyj2tPLxKvvnNPA
Infant mortality (rate per 1,000 births)	http://spreadsheets.google.com/pub?key=phAwcNAVuyj0NpF2PTov2Cw
Under five mortality rate (per 1,000 live births)	http://spreadsheets.google.com/pub?key=phAwcNAVuyj05ZR69usyQIg
Overall access to adequate water supply (urban and rural)	http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Data.aspx
Access to sanitation (%)	
Poverty headcount ratio at \$2 a day (%)	http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SI.POV.2DAY

Pillar 4: Acceptance of the Rights of Others

Indicator	Data Source
Discriminatory Family Code Value (2012)	http://genderindex.org/ranking A score of closer to 0 is more equal and less discriminatory.
Restricted Physical Rights Value (2012)	
Restricted Civil Liberties Value (2012)	
Mean age at first marriage (2005)	

Pillar 5: Good Relations with Neighbors

Indicator	Data Source
Intimate Partner Violence – Physical –	http://www.endvawnow.org/uploads/browser/files

Lifetime %	/vaw_prevalence_matrix_15april_2011.pdf
Intimate Partner Violence – Sexual-Lifetime %	
Intimate Partner Violence – Physical and/or Sexual – Lifetime %	
Murdered Women (per 100,000) (2004)	http://spreadsheets.google.com/pub?key=tyeSLo9Zpmw_e05IR3EoReg&output=xls
Murdered Men (per 100,000) (2004)	http://spreadsheets.google.com/pub?key=tHgVOu-6TYQ6Kig0Ur3Y-kw&output=xls
Women who feel safe alone at night (%)	http://www.gallup.com/poll/155402/women-feel-less-safe-men-developed-countries.aspx
Men who feel safe alone at night (%)	

Pillar 6: Free Flow of Information

Indicator	Data Source
Global Press Freedom Rankings	http://www.freedomhouse.org/sites/default/files/Global%20and%20regional%20tables.pdf

Pillar 7: High Levels of Human Capital

Indicator	Data Source
Ratio of female to male primary enrollment (%)	http://databank.worldbank.org/data/views/variableselection/selectvariables.aspx?source=world-development-indicators
Ratio of female to male secondary enrollment (%)	
Youth Literacy Rate of Girls (aged 15-24 years) (2010)	http://data.unicef.org/education/overview
Adult Literacy Rate of Women (aged 15 years and older) (2010)	
Literacy Rate Rank (2013)	http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_GenderGap_Report_2013.pdf
Literacy Rate Score (2013)	

Pillar 8: Low Levels of Corruption.

Indicator	Data Source
Corruption Perception Rank	http://www.transparency.org/cpi2014/results

GENERAL FINDINGS

1. Well-Functioning Government

Within the case studies evaluated, there was very low female representation in parliament. Of all the country case studies, only Rwanda had over 50 percent (63.8 % in the Upper house and 38.5% in the lower house) representation of women in the national parliament as at the last election.

From 1949 to 1978, women in all the country case studies attained the right to vote and be voted for. Deserving particular mention is the case of Nigeria. Women in the southern part of the country attained the right to vote 20 years (1958) before their northern counterparts (1978). Of the five country case studies, there are set gender quotas. In the cases of Nigeria and Cambodia, no set gender quotas could be established for women in governance

2. Sound Business Environment

It was discovered that there are laws that mandate both paid and unpaid maternity and paternity leave in Colombia, Rwanda and Bosnia Herzegovina. However, the case is different in Nigeria and Cambodia where there are laws that only mandate both paid and unpaid maternity leave. The Retirement age with full benefits for men and women is the same in Nigeria (50 years), Cambodia (55 years), Rwanda (55 years) and Bosnia Herzegovina (65 years). In Colombia however, there are different retirement ages with full benefits for men (62 years) and women (57 years).

In Bosnia, Colombia, Nigeria and Rwanda there are no laws that mandate nondiscrimination based on gender in hiring while in Cambodia, such laws exist. Further, In Bosnia Herzegovina, Colombia, Nigeria, and Rwanda there is no data on laws that mandate equal remuneration for men and women. In Cambodia however, these laws exist.

While in Colombia, there is no data on whether non pregnant and non-nursing women can do the same jobs as men, in Bosnia Herzegovina, Nigeria, Cambodia, and Rwanda these group of women do the same jobs as men.

There are laws that mandate public provision of childcare for children below primary school age in Bosnia Herzegovina, Colombia and Cambodia while in Nigeria and Rwanda these provisions do not exist.

Furthermore, there are no specific tax deductions applicable to only men or women in Bosnia, Colombia, Nigeria, and Rwanda. In Cambodia, however, while there are no specific tax deductions applicable to only women, tax deductions exist for men.

There are about 59 % of women in the Colombian workforce, 48% in the Nigerian workforce, 82% in the Cambodian workforce, 88% in the Rwandan workforce and 42% in the Bosnia Herzegovina workforce.

3. Equitable Distribution of Resources

The life expectancy average of all the countries studied is 67.64. However Of all the countries reviewed, Nigeria has the lowest life expectancy rate (52 years) while Bosnia Herzegovina have the highest life expectancy rate (77.3 years). In the same light, the average infant mortality rate per 1000 births of the countries studied is 34.56. Nigeria (77.8 and 123.8 respectively) has the highest infant mortality rate and under five mortality rate per 1000 births, while Bosnia Herzegovina (5.8 and 6.9 respectively) have an infant mortality rate and under five mortality rate per 1000 births.

Concerning access to water and sanitation, the average scores of access to water was 78 percent, while that of access to sanitation was 60.6 across all countries studied. Once again, Bosnia Herzegovina scored better than all countries studied with a record of 100 percent access both sanitation and water. While Nigeria recorded the lowest numbers with 61 percent access to water and 31 percent access to sanitation.

For poverty headcount ratio at 2 dollars a day, the average percentage for the countries studied was 58 percent. Nigeria possesses the highest percentage, with 84.5% of the population living on 2 dollars or less per day. Conversely, we found that Colombia possesses the lowest percentage with 15.8 percent of the population living on 2 dollars or less per day. This data was unavailable for Bosnia Herzegovina.

4. Acceptance of the Rights of Others

Over the years, the rights of women in the countries under study have undoubtedly improved. This may be an attestation to the rising role of gender based activism all over the world. However, one of the common threads among the countries studied is that while there are laws against rape, there are little or no laws that perceive spousal rape as being an offence. The explicit exception to this is the case of Rwanda which clearly views spousal rape as an offence.

The legal age of marriage in the countries studied is 18 years of age with an exception of Rwanda whose legal age of marriage is set at 21. However, in Colombia marriage between the ages of 14 and 18 is permissible under parental consent, In Cambodia, marriage between the ages of 16 and 18 is also permissible under parental consent. One of the key trends is that within some of the countries, there is evidence of regional disparities. For instance as noted above under well-functioning government, women in the southern part of Nigeria attained the right to vote 20 years before their northern counterparts. This was also evident in the legal age of first marriage of women in both the northern and southern regions of the country, in the south it ranges between 18-21 years of age while in the North it ranges between 12- 15 years of age.

Generally, there is little or no law that permits women to have equal inheritance rights with men, however Rwanda presents a different case as there are laws that protect the rights of wives to

inherit family property in the event of the death of a husband. In Colombia, there is no evidence of discrimination against Colombian women in regard to inheritance, in Nigeria there is no customary law that permits women to have equal inheritance rights with men, similarly in Cambodia, men have more power over property than women

5. Good Relations with Neighbors

Findings reveal that more men stated that they felt comfortable working alone at night than their female counterparts with an average of 71% for men and 66% for women. Similarly, reported murder cases per 100,000 deaths reveal higher reported murder rates for men than of women with a 57.5 male average across all country cases and an 8.8 female average¹.

Generally, domestic violence continues to be a huge problem, with 56.4% reported cases in Rwanda, 37.4% reported cases in Colombia, and 18.3% reported cases in Nigeria, as well as 15.4% reported cases in Cambodia. Findings reveal that there were more reported cases of intimate partner physical violence than there was for intimate partner sexual violence.

6. Free Flow of Information

According to the data, Rwanda (ranks 174 out of 197), and Cambodia (ranks 149 out of 197) do not have free flow of information. Whereas the flow of information in Nigeria (ranks 106 out of 197), Colombia (ranks 112 out of 197) and Bosnia Herzegovina is partly free.

7. High levels of human capital

In looking at the gendered dimensions of literacy and education in the country case studies, the literacy rate in Rwanda between male and females is almost equal, and that within various levels of education, there was gender parity at the primary and secondary levels compared to at tertiary levels. Youth literacy rate of girls was 77.8% while that of adult women was 67.5%. There is a slight disparity in Cambodia between the literacy rate of males and females, with a 66% literacy rate for females and 83% for males. Also in Cambodia, of the females of primary school age 97 percent of females are enrolled, while 100 percent of males are enrolled. At the secondary school level 36 % of females are enrolled while 39% of males are enrolled. This number further reduces as one approaches the tertiary school level with 11 percent of enrolled female students and 18 percent for enrolled males. The case appears different in Colombia where the gender disparity between males and females educational attainment is almost non-existent. Similar to the case of Cambodia, the gender disparity of males and females as regards educational attainment in Nigeria is seemingly wide with 66.1% for females in their youth and 50 .4% for adult females. In Bosnia, adult literacy rate for women scores at 97% in comparison to 99% for males.

A common thread across most of the countries studied is that the higher one goes on the ladder of education, the fewer women one encounters.

8. Low Levels of Corruption

¹ These averages do not include Bosnia Herzegovina as no data could be found.

Using the corruption perception index which scores countries based on how corrupt they are perceived to be with a score closer to zero (0) meaning a country is more corrupt and one closer to a hundred (100) meaning a country is less corrupt. Corruption is a rampant issue among almost all countries studied. In 2013, the only country scoring above 50 was Rwanda with a score of 55, however in 2014, none of the countries studied had a score above 50. We found that in 2013, according to the corruption index, Rwanda had a score of 53, Bosnia had a score of 42, Colombia had a score of 36, Nigeria 25, and Cambodia 20. According to the data retrieved, among all the countries studied, Nigeria and Cambodia were the most corrupt. However, a review of the 2014 Corruption Index, revealed that countries that were perceived as less corrupt in the previous year, scored slightly lower in 2014. Rwanda went from 55 to 49, Bosnia from 42 to 39, while the remaining countries improved slightly, Colombia going from 36 to 37, Nigeria from 25 to 27 and Cambodia from 20 to 21.

CONCLUSIONS AND NEXT STEPS

The focus of the Coral Group has been to further the understanding of building positive peace and gender equity in conflicted regions by examining the eight pillars of positive peace through a gendered lens.

The Coral Group was able to successfully identify gendered indicators for many of the pillars of positive peace. The findings help present a more nuanced and complete picture of levels of peacefulness in the given countries.

While the search for gendered data and indices to qualify the eight pillars proved to be a challenge in some cases, the collection of the gendered data is an initially foray into examining the relationship between positive peace and gender justice. This project has made it abundantly clear that we must continue to speak about the importance of the role of women in peacebuilding in order to raise awareness that research must include a gendered perspective.

The Coral Group suggests consideration of the following next steps:

- Further selection of appropriate gender-sensitive indicators
- Search for robust gendered data to support the indices
- Development of research agendas to fill the gaps where data is missing
- Further refinement of a gendered approach to valuing the rankings of the PPI
- Dissemination of gendered PPI findings to stakeholders of policies and programs whose missions are to support the establishment of sustainable positive peace